

DOSSIER Trafficking for the Purposes of Sexual Exploitation of Paraguayan Women and Girls in Spain Proposals for Effective International Cooperation





# THE UNTOLD STORY



Rocío Nieto
APRAMP President and Director

When I began working for prostituted women over 25 years ago in Spain, I couldn't imagine how cruel reality was going to become. I didn't know then that the work of APRAMP in the 21<sup>st</sup> century would be focused on identifying and rescuing enslaved women and girls from the other side of the world.

But such is the reality; in 2010, the police identified more than 1,000 potential victims of human trafficking of Paraguayan nationality and of them, 142 women and girls were recognized as victims. Victims who have been deceived and obligated to prostitute themselves, and who have been sexually enslaved as part of a very profitable business for Spaniards and Paraguayans, in which they are both complicit.

In Spain, after years of effort, the society is beginning to become aware of this reality, and victims are beginning to be treated as more than illegal immigrants.

However, in Paraguay? Does the Paraguayan society know that thousands of women and, the worst part, hundreds of girls are sold as merchandise through a perverse system of fraud and debt which turns them into slaves, into sex slaves? Is it known that part of the money received from remittances comes from the exploitation of their compatriots?

In APRAMP alone we have rescued and helped 73 Paraguayans in Madrid, identifying 160 individuals in one year and, in the last 3 years, 230 girls from Paraguay. We consider these to be alarming figures, making us reflect on the need to initiate a necessary cooperation between Spain and Paraguay that contributes to the prevention and prosecution of this crime as well as protecting and providing reparation to the victims of this grave violation of human rights.

In APRAMP it is clear to us that, alone, our daily effort and work with Paraguayan women in Spain cannot solve this terrible reality. It is necessary to combine efforts, and that both countries recognize the problem, make it visible and assume their obligations.

#### IT'S TIME TO ACT!

# WHAT TRAFFICKING FROM PARAGUAY TO SPAIN LOOKS LIKE

1

## WHY PARAGUAY, WHY SPAIN?

#### THE STATISTICS

More than **1,000** Paraguayan women were identified in **2010** by Spanish police as possible victims of trafficking working in prostitution in Spain. 142 women were identified as victims of human trafficking. This means that Paraguay is the 3<sup>rd</sup> country of origin of modern-day slavery in Spain, with a growing number of identified victims every year. This data coincides with APRAMP's statistics which has gone from rescuing 17 Paraguayans in 2007 to 73 in 2010, identifying this year up to 160 women and girls of Paraguayan nationality in only one city. **This data represents just the tip of the iceberg** and it is more than likely that this figure is just a small percentage of reality.

#### WHO ARE THE VICTIMS

Although many of the victims come from the same places, being more vulnerable those individuals who are poor and from indigenous communities, the reality is that any young woman looking for work abroad can be a potential victim. Women with and without education, single or married, of different ages between 18 and 35, including those beyond 35 years of age. Normally, without a history of prostitution before being forced into it.

They tend to be proactive individuals who have decided to embark on the adventure of immigration, trying to leave behind a situation of violence, often within the family circle which includes systematic sexual abuses

Many of the victims tend to have experienced critical family situations such as the absence of family protection, violence and sexual abuse by their parents and neighbors. Situations that generate, above all in adolescents, a feeling of not having

anything to lose by immigrating, encouraging their escape.

#### MOTIVES FOR EMIGRATING

The incentives for immigration are connected: to progress economically, to meet urgent needs, to study, to escape from family violence, or a lack of freedom, many of them being underage girls between 16 and 17 years old.

The vulnerability of **the victims is enhanced by restrictive migratory policies**, a weak response to the criminal networks and their own socioeconomic situation, women without work, who suffer or have suffered violence and adolescent mothers in situations of social exclusion. The majority of Paraguayan victims identified by APRAMP in 2010 were single mothers.

#### WHY SPAIN, WHY PARAGUAY

For many Paraguayans, coming to Spain is a dream in order to better their lives; in fact, the community of Paraguayan nationals is constantly growing in Spain. The lack of employment, the precarious nature of the labor market, low salaries and the perception of not being able to progress, combined with the lack of equal opportunities and the gender and sexual violence that women suffer, tend to be the main reasons for emigration.

Additionally, in Spain, there has been a strong demand for cheap manual labor within sectors of the shadow economy such as the care of family members, domestic service and prostitution, sectors without legal or social protection.

**Neither Spain nor the European Union demands a visa** to come as a tourist, facilitating entry into the country. This fact has modified the origin of victims,

from Colombia, in a time when they did not require a visa, to originate now from Romania, Brazil, and Paraguay, by order of importance.

Spain is the third country in the world for the **demand of prostitution**, with 28% of men confessing to having paid for sex.

#### **VICTIMS OF FRAUD**

All of the victims have one thing in common: they apply for a job abroad and do not have the initial funds or contacts to achieve it.

They are victims of fraud, they trust that they have found an opportunity.

The model of progress told again and again through the success stories and sent remittances, that upon improving the quality of life of their family **the origin** of the money that comes from Europe is not questioned and, the victims, for fear or shame, do not tell the truth.

Many of them end up signing a notarized contract, seizing family properties, in case they are not able to pay the debt they incur for making the journey. That debt, leads them to accept terrible conditions of exploitation, in the majority of cases, sexual. The majority of these victims do not originally come from a world of prostitution. Those that do, it is because they have been introduced into processes of domestic trafficking that has led them to surviving on working in prostitution.

# NETWORKS THAT TRADE PEOPLE: A VERY PROFITABLE BUSINESS

Due to the ways in which they operate, they are organized networks, which have detected in the market a very profitable product and without many risks. In 2009, 138 investigations were carried out in Paraguay, but only 2 individuals ended up being charged and sentenced with just 2 years in prison.

The Networks tend to consist of relatives, friends, neighbors and elderly persons that do not provoke mistrust, who play the role of captor **in exchange for earning 15 Euros.** They look for "pretty" women and girls in need or who desire to find a job, who are open to emigrate in order to find one and who are without resources to do so.

They offer them jobs adapted to the cultural levels of the victims, from employment in supermarkets, bars and hotels for those who have a higher level of education, to jobs in domestic service and elderly care for those with a lower level or, even work in the world of publicity for those who are physically attractive. They resort to persuasion, hiding the conditions and



debt they are going to incur, offering unrealistic salaries in Spain, between 600 and 2000 Euros. Additionally, there are the so-called "hidden or secret recruiters", travel and employment agencies that function as a decoy with job offers published in the press.

After, professional Paraguayan recruiters, at times also from the immediate environment of the victims, including relatives, take advantage of the closeness and trust. They put themselves in charge of organizing the trip and the necessary training to help the victims pass as tourists. They earn, in exchange, 600€ if the destination is Spain. The level of benefit is increased if the victim is a virgin, being that in Spain they pay 400€ for the first "sexual service" of a virgin. They have put together a system of **debt guarantee** through notarized contracts. They give victims upfront the necessary money, the required amount for travel in order to enter in Europe as a tourist, 500€, and they buy and organize trips through distinct European routes (from San Paulo, or Buenos Aires to Milan, Paris, Lisbon, Madrid). They also provide them with new clothes, a suitcase, and hairdressing services so they look like tourists, as well as the hotel and tour guide hired in the destination, all these costs are transferred to and increase the debt.

They count on **the complicity and cooperation of the state agents** in exchange for payments in order to accelerate the documentation process, **the falsification of legal permits** for minors and facilitating the crossing of borders.

The financial backers tend to be owners of the brothels in the destination and it is with them with whom the debt is incurred. The women receive money from Spain directly in their name and the sender tends to be other women who work for the network, that way there is no reference to the traffickers.

There is a structured framework between Paraguay and Argentina. On occasion, the victims have been subjected to and exploited in Argentina, before being moved to Spain, in a process of refinement and training that includes the subjection to sexual exploitation.

#### **DESTINATION: SPAIN**

Trafficking in Paraguay is characterized by heterogeneity in the zones of origin and destination, although two countries stand out above any other destination: Argentina and Spain.

The ease of crossing the borders with Argentina makes it so that minors are trafficked first in Argentina. Many begin in Argentina where they are "improved" physically (dentures, cosmetic operations, etc.) and culturally, learning Castilian.

For Spain, they look for individuals with a higher cultural preparation and a physical appearance that is better, younger and maintained, "white, thin and pretty". The main destination is that which gives greater benefits.

In addition to the economic benefit, Spain is the destination for victims of trafficking for a variety of reasons that go from the ease of the language, the cultural similarities, the ability to find Paraguayan emigrant communities, to **the very conditions of Spain as a global hub for prostitution** and the fact that a visa is not required for individuals from Paraguay in order to enter as a tourist.

#### **VICTIMS, NOT OFFENDERS**

Once in Spain, the victims cruelly discover that **the future promised to them is not what awaits them.**They owe money and the mafia has **taken away their passports**, the only possible way out is to accept the conditions: work in prostitution in order to pay off the debt.

Deceived and threatened in an **unknown country**, **they find themselves lost and isolated**, without knowledge of the cultural norms nor of Castilian; the majority of victims have never left Paraguay. Finally, the victims, because of different methods such as violence or captivity, are subjected to false hope that upon paying the debt, they will be free and able to begin a new future in Spain.

However, once again reality deceives them, **their debt never ends**. In difficult conditions, obligated to attend to "clients" at all hours, **to consume drugs and alcohol**, they do not have control over any aspect of the business. Their debt begins to increase, every day owing a minimum of 30€ for food and housing and, in addition, paying elevated prices for clothes and hygiene products. Every day the debt is not paid off, the victims **are punished with fines**, causing them to be in a situation with no way out.

The **owners** of the clubs administer the money that victims earn, taking a 50% cut of the victims' earnings, and it is the owners who **decide how the debt will be paid off**. In the first few months almost all of the money goes towards paying off the victims' debt, and

they are allowed to send money home, sometimes as an advance with interests. A mechanism of permanent indebtedness, hindering the possibility of getting rid of their debt and creating a dependency on the networks.

The conditions vary, from "owners" who do not allow victims to move freely, to others who do permit them to leave under a certain level of control, always placing control over minors.

In the end, they accept the situation due to the threats against them and their families, or for economic necessity, they need to send money home or, for fear of their irregular administrative situation, being that they are unaware of the existing conditions and protection in Spain.

#### **FEAR OF POLICE**

In Spain, they run the risk of being treated as immigrants in irregular administrative situations, of being detained and sent to a detention center for migrants. Additionally, despite their rights as victims recognized by Law, in the end, many end up being repatriated once again to the place where they were captured.

#### PHYSICAL AND MENTAL HEALTH CONSEQUENCES

Both sexual and labor exploitation are grave violations of human rights which produce significant damage to the mental health of victims. The situation of isolation, the degree of competition in which the owners generate amongst the women and the systematic abuses at the hands of the owners as well as the clients are causes of the emotional damage these victims suffer.

Primarily for girls and adolescents, it is the uprooting, disorientation, forced prostitution, threats, isolation, confinement and lack of community support.

Obligated to practice sex without protection, they contract illnesses, have abortions, and become addicted to drugs and alcohol, greatly compromising their health.

#### HOW TO ESCAPE HUMAN TRAFFICKING

The end comes from police and judicial actions, escapes with the help of other women or clients or, from the family pressure against the recruiters. There are times when upon escaping, the victims see themselves as obligated to survive by prostituting themselves.

Their return is not always easy. The families reject them for the stigma or, on the contrary, accept the situation for the money they have received and prefer the silence over filing a complaint. Many women at the rejection and social stigma opt for silence and do not file complaints for the loss of respect and the

impossibility of finding a job, being that the complaints are made public.

The women, in the end, take stock and, at the lack of prospects for future support or justice, they decide

not to return, being that they at least earn money and have more autonomy once the debt is paid off.

# IN 2010 SPANISH POLICE IDENTIFIED MORE THAN 1,000 POSSIBLE PARAGUAYAN VICTIMS



# THE VOICE OF VICTIMS

2

## "What other option did we have? For our families."

### LIZ, 17 years old

Her dream, to work in Spain Her nightmare, 8 months of sexual slavery in Madrid

I'm Liz, from Paraguay. I grew up in the country with my grandparents and my four younger brothers. I was in charge of everything, of cleaning, of my brothers; I always woke up really early -at 4am-, and later went to school. I was tired of the situation; I was fed up, what could be waiting for me in Paraguay?

### "I WAS IN THAT HELL FOR 8 MONTHS, OBLIGATED TO SLEEP WITH HUNDREDS OF WOMEN"

My girlfriends told me that there was a lot of work in Spain, that one could earn a lot of money and that one lives well. All of them had the same dream: travel to Spain. One male friend told us that he knew an agency that organized the whole trip. They found a job for me and took care of everything. They bought me clothes, they explained how I was going to pass as a tourist, they paid for the plane ticket and they gave me 500€ to cross the border.

I traveled with 10 other girls, we were in Rome a few days and I arrived in Madrid, where they picked us up and took us to a house. I was so tired; it wasn't until the next day I realized where I was. A woman entered, very made up and intoxicated, and she gave us clothes and said "put these to work".

I was in that hell for 8 months, obligated to sleep with hundreds of men, to do things I never imagined. I was always thinking about escaping, but how? I was controlled all day, every time I refused to do something, they beat me, and they put me in isolation and without food. I was really scared. They forced me to consume drugs and alcohol, cocaine, with clients. Sometimes I felt like crying with clients, I wanted to tell them, but I didn't dare to.

One day the police arrived and they detained me for not having documentation. They took us to the police station, I was very afraid, but I told the truth. The police offered me the possibility of going to an Attention Centre, and I agreed.

Thanks to APRAMP, I have been able to understand the situation that thousands of Paraguayan girls live in Spain, that everything is part of a scheme beginning from my country, to abuse us, to make money at our expense. I filed a complaint and I attended the trial through video conference, they really hurt me.

I have been able to begin a new life here, working in APRAMP helping to identify other women in the same situation.

### **NOELIA & ZULLY**

Married with children, they came to work in households

Deceived and forced into prostitution in an apartment

We are Paraguayans from Asunción, both from the same neighborhood. My name is Noelia, and I'm married and have 5 children. Zully, who also travelled with me, she has 4 children. Life was not easy and we needed to work. I had already been in Brazil working in a household. The situation is desperate in Paraguay. We listened to a man who told us that he found jobs for women to work in domestic service in Spain, and we went to the agency that he told us about.

In the agency, they gave us information, they took care of everything, they loaned us the money for the trip.

## "WE SIGNED BEFORE A NOTARY, I PUT MY HOUSE, ZULLY THAT OF HER BROTHER-IN-LAW. IF WE DIDN'T PAY OFF THE DEBT THEY WOULD THROW OUR CHILDREN OUT ON THE STREETS"

I travelled four months before Zully. We travelled through different routes; I went from Sao Paolo, to Milan, then to Madrid, she went through Sao Paolo, Argentina, Amsterdam and France, and then to Madrid. We arrived together in Madrid. At the airport, one woman was waiting for us and she took us to a house where 15 other people lived. Upon arriving, we realized that everything was a scheme, and the job they promised didn't exist.

After a few days passed, they told us that we had to pay off the debt, that if we didn't they would take away our homes and leave our children in the streets. In order to be able to pay, we had to engage in prostitution. Clients came to the apartment, and we weren't allowed to leave. What other option did we have, for our families?

The girls at APRAMP came to the apartment to hand out contraceptives and ask us about our health. In the beginning, we were really scared. We could escape thanks to them. We went to a drop-in center. We received support and training, I have been able to improve my Spanish, and learn to sew.

Yes, we filed a report, it is important that this does not continue happening to more Paraguayans.

#### **SARA**

Deceived by her boyfriend and her sister-in-law She has been able to return to Paraguay

I am Paraguayan and I am 19 years old. I am the second of three sisters. I lived well in my house, we didn't have economic problems.

The problem was that my father didn't like my boyfriend, he didn't want me to see him anymore but I didn't listen to him. So, he sent me to Argentina to be with my aunt. I was bored, I wanted to work and although she didn't let me go out alone, I went, I wanted to find work. That day, a man grabbed me in the street and raped me. I didn't say anything to my

aunt and uncle, I didn't say anything to anyone and I returned to Paraguay.

In Paraguay, I met a guy and I started to go out with him, his sister was in Spain. He told me that his sister worked as a waitress in a bar, that she earned a lot of money there. He told me that they needed more people to work in the bar.

My boyfriend's sister arranged everything for us; she sent us the money to pay for both of our trips.

When we arrived in Spain, my sister-in-law, my boyfriend's sister, took me to her bar. However, it wasn't just any bar, it was a hostess bar. She told me that my job was to get the clients to consume a lot of alcohol, and that I had to do whatever possible to make it happen. When the first client approached me, I couldn't believe it; he proposed I go with him to a private room. I told him no, but then the owner of the bar and my sister-in-law came up to me and they told me I had to go with him, that I owed them money. I had to do it.

# "I COULDN'T BELIEVE IT! I HAD TO SLEEP WITH THE CLIENTS."

My boyfriend didn't believe me, he told me that it was true, that his sister was a waitress and that she had done us a huge favor. That same day his sister came, she threatened me and took me to a new place. I had to pay off my debt. Fortunately, the second day the police came and I could explain my situation.

They offered me the opportunity to go to an Attention Center and I came to know APRAMP. I was housed there and they helped me file a report. After some time, I decided to return to Paraguay to be with my family.

# DECEIVED BY HER OWN FAMILY

#### **ROSA**

#### At 17 years of age her parents sent her to Spain

My name is Rosa and I'm from Paraguay, I was 17 years old when my family brought me to Spain.

I want to come to work, but my aunts had other plans for me: to be a sex slave.

Here I have discovered that this does not only happen to me, it happens to many, to thousands of Paraguayans.

#### My life in Paraguay

I am the oldest of 5 brothers, we lived in the countryside. I was in charge of the house, of my brothers, of the cleaning, of everything.

Life at home was not easy, I was the only solution, to go to Spain and send money home.

#### Reasons to emigrate

There wasn't any other solution, I didn't have a future either and my family was my responsibility.

My parents organized everything, for me and for my cousin, with my aunts who already living in Spain. They offered us a good job.

And my situation at home wasn't good, I wanted to leave, I dreamed about another life.

I knew that many women from my city were working in prostitution in Spain, but not my aunts, they were working in a bar. I never imagined what they dedicated their time to or the plans they had for us.

#### **Travel arrangements**

Here an agency took care of everything, they bought us our tickets, they gave us Spanish classes; I only spoke Guarani. They also told us how to pass through control at the airport.

We had to be relaxed and say that we were coming to visit Spain because our aunts lived here and that we were going to return in one month.

I was a minor, in just a few days the agency got the paperwork, the permit so that a minor could leave the country. In Paraguay, they did tell my father what could happen, but I was going with my aunt. What could happen to me?

My family had to sign before a notary that if we didn't pay off the debt of my trip, they would lose the house.

#### The trip

My cousin and I travelled together along with other girls, from Asunción to Sao Paulo and directly to Madrid, where my aunts and their Ecuadorian boyfriends were waiting for us.

In the airport, the police only asked us what we were going to do, if we came to work, we said no and they let us pass.

Later, they took us to their house, in the beginning, during the first few days they treated us well, although they never let us leave.

#### The reality of the fraud

One day they took us to visit the club where my aunts worked, so that we could see how beautiful it was. They bought us lingerie and showed us pornography to teach us how to do it. When we refused they locked us in the basement and didn't let me leave for six months.

They took my cousin, not me because since I was only 17 years old, they didn't want to take the risk.

My cousin cried; there were days where she had to sleep with up to 40 men.

They began to beat me, to punish me without food, we were very scared.

When I was left alone with one of my aunts' boyfriends, they began to fondle me, to say things to me, they said that they wanted me, and they touched me. I told my ants, but they didn't believe me and they punished and beat me.

One day they took me with an old man, he was going to pay 400€ to be with me because I was a virgin. That night, he stayed with my cousin; I would go when I turned 18 years old, my aunts didn't want to take risks.

I was scared, I spent much time locked up alone, I thought that when I turned 18 years old, the same thing would happen to me. I couldn't believe that my aunts were doing this.

I could talk to my mother, but only to tell her lies.

I saw my cousin and it made me very sad. It was rough, very rough. I wasn't in the country legally; who could I turn to? I was alone; I didn't know how to speak Spanish.

# "THEY TOOK MY COUSIN. THE FIRST DAY SHE HAD TO SLEEP WITH 40 MEN. THEY REALLY HURT HER. SHE CAME BACK BLEEDING."

#### Rescue

The police arrived to the club where my cousin was and since she didn't have documentation, they spoke with her, and she told them that she wanted to return to Paraguay and that she didn't want to be here. The police told her they would help her to return. So my cousin told only me and she said she did it for me, that upon arriving in Paraguay she would speak with my parents and the police so they could rescue me. She didn't care what people thought of her.

My cousin left, and one day the police arrived, they asked for me, my aunts told them that I wasn't there and that I didn't live there. I drew up the courage and screamed that I was there, and they took me out of there and brought me to APRAMP.

#### Recovery

In the beginning I didn't trust anyone in APRAMP; I wanted to get out of there. Little by little I got to know other girls that had also been deceived and I realized that it was something that happened to more people. In my case, it was my family and that was really hard.

Now I know my future is her. What future was I going to have in Paraguay?

I was very lucky, and I am still clean, but knowing what people would say, what would be of my cousin?

No, I didn't want to return. I know that here, thanks to APRAMP, I am going to have more opportunities, I'm studying, I'm going to work.

#### **Justice**

I have made a declaration, no, I have not filed a report, they are my family.

Yes, I speak with my mother every once in a while, it's very difficult; it takes a lot of work.

If I only I didn't have to come, but In Paraguay, for poor families, for their daughters, there aren't many opportunities, everyone abuses us. What future awaits us?

For those people who have come to Spain, it always seems like things are going well for them, but it's not true. Someone should tell what is happening, and how they convert so many Paraguayans into slaves, into sex slaves against their will.

There should have been more justice, we are not the guilty one, the guilty ones are those who deceived us and earned a lot of money from us. Paraguay should wake up to this sad reality.



# PROTECTION FRAMEWORK

3

# SPANISH FRAMEWORK OF PROTECTION

Spain, despite the ratification of the United Nations Palermo Protocol in 2003, did not begin to structure a response to the problem until the end of 2008. In 2008 the Spanish Government ratified the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings and in December of 2008 lances the first Comprehensive Plan to Combat Trafficking in Persons for Purposes of Sexual Exploitation.

#### INTERNATIONAL COMMITMENTS

The Council of Europe Convention, known as the Warsaw Convention, obligates Spain to incorporate a human rights-based approach in their fight against the trafficking of human beings centered on victims. This is important, because up until that date the objective of identifying and protecting victims was present, but relegated to other police objectives: migration control and the fight against organized crime.

#### FIGHT AGAINST CLANDESTINE IMMIGRATION

Spain has suffered an enormous migratory pressure in the last 15 years, recording the highest rate in Europe. Border control and irregular immigration have been and continue to be priorities for the Government and State Security Forces and Bodies. Being in Spanish territory in an irregular administrative situation amounts to administrative infringement and the police have the obligation to initiate a procedure of expulsion to those individuals who find themselves in such a situation. Identity checks are frequent and are intensified in determined environments such as is in the setting of prostitution. Being that more than 90% of the women who engage in prostitution in this country are foreigners. The police can detain individuals "without papers", transfer them to the police station, including, continue to detention in an Internment Center for Foreigners, from where they

can be expelled from the country. In fact, the risk of deportation for victims of human trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation is very high due to the lack of priority given to identification in the face of migration control.

#### FIGHT AGAINST ORGANIZED CRIME

Another factor that also affects the protection of victims is the fight against organized crime. The United Nations considers that the human trafficking market supposes the third most profitable illegal business after drugs and weapons. The interest of police in investigations is centered fundamentally on dismantling organized crime networks and mafias. Until now, the victims were interviewed to obtain evidence and, in fact the victims can opt for the authorization of a residence and work permit if they collaborate with the police investigation and the judicial process.

# COMPREHENSIVE PLAN TO COMBAT HUMAN TRAFFICKING

In December of 2008 the Government presented the first Comprehensive Plan to Combat Trafficking in Persons for Purposes of Sexual Exploitation. A 3-year plan that entails the triggering of measures and actions based on the international commitments undertaken by the Spanish State.

#### **REFORM OF THE PENAL CODE**

Thus, in 2010, the Spanish Penal Code was modified and the specific offence of Trafficking in Persons was introduced, not typified until now. The new Article 177bis dispelled the previous confusion between trafficking and smuggling that had been dragging on in Spain. In this article, the offence takes into account all forms of exploitation, and it establishes sentences of 5 to 8 years imprisonment.

#### **IMMIGRATION LAWS**

The only law which takes into account the rights of victims of trafficking is the Immigration Law 12/2009 which includes, in article 59bis, the right to the authorization of a residence and work permit for collaboration against organized crime. This modification incorporates commitments of the Warsaw Convention such as the concession of a period of recovery and reflection of at least 30 days for victims and potential victims of trafficking. The objective of this period is that the victim can recover and freely and consciously decide if she wishes to collaborate with the justice system in Spain. The victims who collaborate with the justice system can access the authorization of a residence and work permit for 5 years. Those who decide not to collaborate can opt for an authorization due to personal circumstances.

#### **VOLUNTARY RETURN AND RIGHT TO ASYLUM**

If the victim decides to return to her country, she can solicit assisted voluntary return through the program managed by the International Organization for Migration (IOM). The right to asylum, due to the risks of persecution and well-founded fear for her life in her country of origin is not considered in practice in Spain, systematically denying all requests.

#### PROTECTION RESOURCES AND ASSITANCE

Resources of protection and holistic assistance are managed by non-governmental organizations, with no existing specialized public resources. Thanks to the

work of these organizations, many victims can recover and opt for training and even a job that permits them to begin a new life.

#### MINOR VICTIMS OF TRAFFICKING

In 2010, the Ministry of Interior communicated that the number of minors identified as victims of trafficking was 13. However, this figure is superseded by the number of victims identified and attended to by specialized organizations. In Spain there are no existing specialized resources for minor victims of trafficking nor are the mechanisms of identification and protection that minors require functioning adequately.

#### AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT

In spite of the advances carried out by Spain, the stories of rescue and rehabilitation or of obtaining justice represent a small percentage of the large majority of women and girls who go unnoticed by authorities and society. Despite the progress made for foreign victims in irregular administrative situations, the application is neither simple nor automatic. The mechanisms are recently implemented and are still not functioning normally due to a lack of training and capacity of police forces.

Many victims continue being deported; the specific figure of how many have agreed to voluntary return or who have been deported despite being identified by police as possible victims is unknown.



## PARAGUAYAN FRAMEWORK OF PROTECTION

In 2004 is when, for the first time, the institutional agenda incorporated the issue of human trafficking. Two cases of assassinations of Paraguayan women who had emigrated and with whom contact had been lost, one of the cases being in Spain, revealed a reality that was, until then, hidden.

Before 2004 isolated actions existed because of filed reports, but beginning this year a response is beginning to be assembled. One of the causes was the international pressure and the Trafficking in Persons Report elaborated by the United States, in which Paraguay appears in the Special Watch List, due to its weak efforts carried out to fight against this grave violation of human rights. This report follows the visit in 2005 of the Ambassador against Trafficking in Persons.

#### THE CRIME OF TRAFFICKING OF HUMAN BEINGS

Human trafficking is considered a crime in Paraguay according to the Penal Code Article 129, modified in 2009. Human trafficking is punishable for the purposes of sexual exploitation, labor exploitation, domestic servitude and the trafficking of organs. Although it envisages and fulfills the purposes established in the Palermo Protocol, it does not recognize domestic trafficking despite being a latent reality.

Other crimes related to human trafficking also exist in Paraguay which would permit that, one way or another, the crime does not go unpunished. As a country of origin it is mainly the recruiters, and in certain cases, the exploiters themselves who are prosecuted.

#### **INVESTIGATION**

The Specialized Unit in Human Trafficking and Child Sexual Exploitation was created in 2003 with national competency.

Reactive investigations are most utilized in Paraguay. The investigation is initiated once a report is filed by the victim herself or by family members, once a request for localization or rescue of the victims has been made, or upon request from abroad.

#### **OFFICIAL STATISTICS**

Between 2009 and 2010 the Public Prosecutor's Office recognizes 140 cases filed as human trafficking, of

them, 30 cases were prosecuted resulting in 18 convictions.

#### **INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION**

The Specialized Unit solicits International Judicial Assistance, through the Directorate of International Affairs of the Public Prosecutor's Office.

The investigation is carried out with the support of the Criminal Investigation Department and its Counter-Trafficking Division and INTERPOL in Asunción under the National Police.

When a report is filed, under the United Nations Nassau Convention, the Directorate of International Affairs solicits a request for international judicial assistance from the destination country. This allows for the initiation of a procedure of personal contact and the exchange of information. Action is taken against the recruiters once intervention with and the rescue of the victim takes place in the country of destination.

In the past few years international cooperation in judicial assistance has given the following results:

20 requests for judicial assistance

8 closed cases

2 cases with convictions in both countries (the same case with distinct processes in each country)

6 convicted cases in Paraguay

48 Paraguayans rescued

Additionally an international seminar was held for the elaboration of an Intervention Protocol.

#### SECRETARIAT FOR WOMEN'S AFFAIRS

The Directorate for the Prevention and Attention to Victims of Human Trafficking was created under the Secretariat for Women's Affairs, whose functions are:

- Consultation for the Elaboration of a special bill for the Prevention and Combating of Human Trafficking, elaborated and submitted at the Coordination of the Bureau (Dec 2009).
- Systematization of the Statistical Data in State and Civil Society Referring Bodies on the Trafficking of Persons and mapping of the Human Trafficking Routes, final result in print, document to be presented in March.
- 3. Representation before the Inter-institutional Bureau for the Prevention and Combating of Human trafficking coordinated by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and, as the Central Unit for Prevention and Attention to Victims,

coordination of the subcommittee on Prevention and Assistance.

From this Directorate, two types of interventions are carried out, first-level interventions in situations of emergency and second-level interventions centered on the development of strategies for prevention and attention to victims.

#### Types of Intervention:

- First order intervention which is an intervention in an emergency that should be addressed immediately.
- Second order intervention which references the elaboration, creation and incorporation of a Care Plan, of strategies directed fundamentally to guaranteeing victims the full enjoyment of all of their human rights, and the posterior follow-up of all activities which have been put in place to achieve it.

Within this model, the Social Reinsertion Program is found, in collaboration with IOM.

**Social Reinsertion Program:** seeks to provide holistic assistance to victims such as to improve and or amplify the socio-economic resources and to decrease the possibilities for re-victimization for Human Trafficking victims.

However, few victims have been able to enjoy these services (in 2010 only 3 women), its scope remaining insufficient.

#### **Shelters for Trafficking Victims**

In August 2008 a shelter for female victims of human trafficking was implemented in Asunción with capacity for 12 individuals, where 100 individuals have been taken in.

These resources are sustained in part by NGOs and international donors. The government provides limited assistance —legal, medical and psychological-to human trafficking victims abroad and subsequently repatriated.



#### **INTER-INSTITUTIONAL BUREU**

It was formed in 2005 by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and gathered around 40 public and civil society entities implicated in the fight against human trafficking. Different commissions were organized to launch proposals for improvement.

#### AREAS OF IMPROVEMENT

Despite all the efforts carried out by the Paraguayan Government in the past few years, with the increase in prosecution of recruiters and the training of officials, Paraguay still is not firmly addressing the grave problem of human trafficking that fundamentally Paraguayan women and girls suffer. The protection of victims continues to be insufficient and inadequate. The system of identification is not adequate, nor is it carried out proactively amongst the most vulnerable individuals. Attention to victims, including returnees, is limited.

In 2009, 138 victims were identified in Paraguay and 78 victims were assisted, of them 30 were minors, however, few file reports due to fear, social stigma and a lack of confidence in the judicial system.

Paraguay should improve the shortcomings in the Law to incorporate the prohibition of domestic trafficking.

Intensify the efforts in identification and prosecution of the crime, as well as in the sentences of those involved.

Dedicate more resources to victims.

Initiate more investigations on public officials who collaborate expediting procedures facilitating human trafficking.

Increase efforts in awareness campaigns, especially among those individuals who search for work abroad.

# APRAMP'S WORK

4



APRAMP was founded as an association in 1984 to work on a project directed towards the Prevention, Reintegration and Assistance to Prostituted Women. The principle focus of its work is centered on, therefore, the Prostituted Woman as an individual in social exclusion. Since then, APRAMP has been a witness to the change of causes and the realities of this population, of the increase in the number of trafficking victims and the increase in their vulnerability.

The association's actions are characterized by its flexibility and adaptability. These criteria permit the gradual adaptation of its programs and services based on the specific needs which are detected in its daily work, particularly with the aim of identifying, empowering and protecting sexually exploited individuals, including victims of trafficking. Thus, APRAMP has progressively become a resource of reference for this population thanks to the intervention model considered today as a model of best practice.

In the last 15 years, and coinciding with the influx of massive immigration, this organization has been able to confirm the growing reality of human trafficking in Spain. Being able to affirm that the immense majority of women in situations of prostitution in Spain are or have been victims of human trafficking. They are primarily women, coming from foreign countries lacking social networks and who are completely unaware of legislation and the language, increasing their situation of vulnerability.

#### **RIGHTS-BASED APPROACH**

APRAMP considers the trafficking of persons a grave violation of human rights, and prostitution as a form

of gender violence, as recognized by the United Nations.

The foundation of the organization's work is based on the recognition of the rights of trafficking victims. It is important that victims can recognize themselves as victims of a violation of human rights, being that many of them come to normalize their situation, not being aware of the exploitation and submission they have suffered. From this recognition, they can embark on a path of recovery and empowerment that permits them to defend their own rights and those of other individuals in the same situation.

#### PROGRAMS AND SERVICES

Through the mobile rescue units, ARAMP is present on the streets and in the contexts of visible and invisible prostitution, such as apartments and saunas, offering useful social health services to the women. Through these services, this association succeeds in becoming a reference for these women, breaking the isolation they suffer.

APRAMP has specialized teams made up of women who have been victims of human trafficking and who have recovered in APRAMP's projects. The experience and the commitment of these social agents are key to being able to identify possible victims and create bonds of trust with them. This confidence is fundamental so that 80% of the women assisted by APRAMP, 280 women each day, decide, in the medium term, to solicit help and support.

APRAMP is not only a rescue service, rather it has a comprehensive approach which includes mechanisms of protection and housing, psychological care, legal consulting, processing of documentation, training and employment programs, etc. This approach intends to achieve a change of behavior and attitudes in



personal relationships, the recovery of self-esteem and access to the labor market with the objective of offering alternatives that permit them to initiate a new life away from the exploitation and slavery suffered.

#### RAISE AWARENESS AMONG SOCIETY

APRAMP is committed to creating awareness among society in order to avoid its indifference to this reality, to discourage the demand of "clients" and to work with professionals who in one way or another could be key actors in the identification of and assistance to trafficking victims. APRAMP implements awareness campaigns, studies and investigations, elaborates guides and tools directed towards professionals, and works continuously with mass media.

#### **NETWORKING**

APRAMP considers essential the coordination and joining of efforts with organizations that work in favor of the rights of prostituted individuals and/or trafficking victims in order to generate synergies that promote change and progress. For that reason, APRAMP is a founding member of the Spanish Network against Human Trafficking, and collaborates with international networks such as the International

Coalition against Trafficking in Women (CATW), specifically in Latin American and the Caribbean.

#### **INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION**

Through the direct work with trafficking victims in Spain, APRAMP analyzes the countries and places where the victims come from, which in many cases is recurring. With the objective of carrying out prevention at its source, APRAMP has initiated international cooperation projects with awareness activities and the strengthening of civil society through the exchange of experience and best practice.

Brazil and, now, Paraguay, where a large part of victims identified by APRAMP come from are those countries with whom they have begun cooperation actions in the procurement of justice for victims in their countries of origin as well.

#### **SOCIAL RECOGNITION OF BEST PRACTICE**

APRAMP is recognized by the Spanish society and has received many awards for its work. It also has the recognition of the authorities and the State bodies and security forces as well as by the Public Prosecutor, being that the large majority of victims assisted by the association decide to collaborate in the police investigation and judicial process.

Without a doubt the most important recognition for APRAMP is the confidence placed in the association by hundreds of trafficking victims who have recovered their freedom they were robbed of.

#### CONTACT

APRAMP Information and Orientation Service. Pza del Angel, 14. 28012 Madrid. Tel. +34 914201708

APRAMP Direct Intervention Unit C/ Jardines, 17. 28013 Madrid. Tel. +34 915303287

24 Hour Emergency Hotline +34 609589479

# PROPOSALS FOR EFFECTIVE INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION

5

The number of Paraguayan victims of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation rises each year.

Cooperation between both countries is pertinent in order to find solutions that can guarantee the rights of victims.

APRAMP has been working for years in favor of the rights of women and girls victims of trafficking, relying on the collaboration with authorities. Because only by working in a joint and integrated manner a problem with such economic interests can be addressed.

But it does not serve any good to only act from Spain. It is necessary to take action from the place of origin, in order to prevent that more individuals become victims and to assist and protect those who return, offering them alternatives.

Spain and Paraguay should assume their obligations to protect, compensate the victims for this grave violation of human rights, prevent and prosecute the crime.

APRAMP advocates for a **convention** between both countries that develops cooperation in different aspects of the fight against human trafficking.

#### FOR PREVENTION

Paraguay and Spain should **recognize and make visible** the serious problem of human trafficking existing in both countries.

They should implement awareness campaigns with the objective of preventing human trafficking at its origin so that more women and girls who are especially vulnerable do not fall into the same known and documented trap. Messages that are effective and geared towards potential victims should be prioritized, fighting against the social stigmatization and rejection of the women who have been forced to engage in prostitution.

And campaigns in the place of destination, in Spain, society, the men who pay for sex should know the reality in order to **discourage the demand**.

Spain, with extensive experience in combating gender violence, should push for channels of cooperation and assessment in order to contribute to the momentum and efforts that Paraguay is initiating through legislative initiatives.

#### FOR PROTECTION

Both countries should make a coordinated effort together to guarantee the **training** of State law enforcement and border police to be able to identify victims. Through seminars and meetings, but also through permanent coordination mechanisms.

A **coordination** necessary to guarantee protection in both countries, prior to, during and posterior to the collaboration of victims with justice. Additionally, coordination necessary for repatriation, be it voluntary or not.

Spain should encourage and put in place development cooperation projects so that Paraguayan women and girls who are victims of trafficking can opt for alternatives such as training and self-employment and micro-credit programs in Paraguay.

Paraguay should structure an effective response to offer protection and a future for victims.

#### FOR PROSECUTION

Coordination necessary also in police investigations and actions. The fact that the exploitation takes place in Spain signifies in reality, that the crime begins in Paraguay. For that reason, both countries should establish effective coordination mechanisms to guarantee the prosecution of the crime of trafficking in its full definition, from recruitment, transfer to exploitation.

There are few cases where justice has acted in the same case in Spain and Paraguay. But in order to prosecute the crime and render justice for the victims and, so that the crime does not go unpunished the crime should be prosecuted in both countries.

The training and collaboration between judges and public prosecutors is, therefore, also essential. Often, the victims return to Paraguay and maintain open cases in Spain. It is necessary to develop adequate mechanisms for protection and assistance to these victims. Otherwise, they will feel alone, unprotected and will not continue with the judicial process.

#### CREATE NETWORKS AMONGST CIVIL SOCIETY

APRAMP proposes to advance in a practical, structured and effective collaboration between organizations in countries of origin and destination of trafficking victims, which would permit in the future the establishment of permanent mechanisms of coordination and joint work.

It proposes the utilization of a participatory methodology with involved public and private actors and constructed based on the experience of the entities working together with victims of trafficking for purposes of sexual exploitation and with individuals in vulnerable environments.

#### **AGAINST GENDER VIOLENCE**

Spain and Paraguay should work together to reduce gender violence, promoting the empowerment of women and equal opportunities through the strengthening of the civil society and the awareness and training of the population at risk.

SPAIN AND PARAGUAY SHOULD ASSUME THEIR OBLIGATION TO PROTECT VICTIMS AND TO PREVENT AND PROSECUTE THE CRIME.







